

The Antinomy of Teleological Judgment

(Immanuel Kant. *Critique of the Power of Judgment* §§ 69–78)

Colloquium

Dr. Ina Goy (Tübingen)

Monday May 2nd – Tuesday May 3rd, 2011
Università degli studi di Milano, Dipartimento di Filosofia

The antinomy of teleological judgment (§§ 69–78) is on one of the most controversial passages of Immanuel Kant's *Critique of the Power of Judgment*. Having developed the idea of a twofold explanation of organisms in §§ 61–68, Kant raises the question whether mechanical and teleological laws of organic nature might pose an antinomy of conflicting principles within the power of judgment. However, what exactly would this conflict be about: Is it an antinomy between regulative or constitutive maxims of the power of judgment? And how precisely is the antinomy to be resolved? Kant seems to indicate at least three solutions of the antinomy: first, the idea of a divine designer (§§ 74–75), second, the idea of an intuitive understanding (§§ 76–77), and third, the idea of a supernatural ground of nature (§ 78). What are the advantages and disadvantages of these solutions? And why is it necessary to guarantee a unification of both types of laws of organic nature at all? Does the antinomy of teleological judgment rather resemble the antinomy of theoretical reason in Kant's first *Critique*, or the antinomy of practical reason in Kant's second *Critique*?

The colloquium will be followed by a paper presentation on *Kant's Theory of Biology and the Argument from Design* on Thursday May 5th, 2011.

All welcome!

Further information: <http://dipartimento.filosofia.unimi.it/index.php/preferiti/crik>

Organizers: Piero Giordanetti (Mailand) & Ina Goy (Tübingen)

Registration & Contact: piero.giordanetti@unimi.it, ina.goy@uni-tuebingen.de

Sponsor: LLP Erasmus

Program

Monday May 2nd, 2011: 2–6 pm

2.00 pm §§ 69–71 What is the Antinomy of Teleological Judgment?

3.45 pm coffee break

4.15 pm §§ 72–73 Dogmatic Conceptions of Teleology

The colloquium takes place at the **Dipartimento di Filosofia, Via Festa del Perdono 7, Sala Riunioni Direzione.**

Tuesday May 3rd, 2011: 2–6 pm

2.00 pm §§ 74–75 First Solution: The Divine Designer

3.00 pm coffee break

3.15 pm §§ 76–77 Second Solution: The Intuitive Understanding

4.45 pm coffee break

5.00 pm § 78 Third Solution: The Supersensible Ground of Nature

The colloquium takes place at the **Dipartimento di Filosofia, Via Festa del Perdono 7, Sala Riunioni Direzione.**

Thursday May 5th, 2011: 2.30–4.30 pm

2.30 pm Kant's Theory of Biology and the Argument from Design

A talk by Ina Goy followed by an informal discussion, presented at the

Università degli Studi di Milano, Via Festa del Perdono 7, aula 102.

Text

Immanuel Kant. Critique of the Power of Judgment, in: *The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*, ed. by Paul Guyer, transl. by Paul Guyer and Eric Matthews, Cambridge 2000; Immanuel Kant, Kritik der Urteilkraft, in: *Kants Werke. Akademie-Textausgabe*, Berlin 1968, V 165–485, esp. V 385–415.

Further Readings

- Allison, Henry E. 2003, Kant's Antinomy of Teleological Judgment, in: Guyer, Paul (ed.), *Kant's Critique of the Power of Judgment: Critical Essays*, New York, 219–236.
- Breitenbach, Angela 2008, Two Views on Nature: A Solution to Kant's Antinomy of Mechanism and Teleology, *The British Journal for the History of Philosophy* 16, 351–369.
- 2009, Mechanismus und Teleologie: Zwei Perspektiven auf die Natur, in: *Die Analogie von Vernunft und Natur*, Berlin/New York, 109–131.
- Förster, Eckart 2002a, Die Bedeutung von §§ 76, 77 der *Kritik der Urteilkraft* für die Entwicklung der nachkantischen Philosophie, *Zeitschrift für philosophische Forschung* 56 (2), 170–190.
- 2002b, Die Bedeutung der §§ 76, 77 der *Kritik der Urteilkraft* für die Entwicklung der nachkantischen Philosophie (Teil II), *Zeitschrift für philosophische Forschung* 56 (3), 321–345.
- 2008, Von der Eigentümlichkeit unseres Verstandes in Ansehung der Urteilkraft (§§ 74–78), in: Höffe, Otfried (ed.), *Immanuel Kant. Kritik der Urteilkraft*, Berlin, 259–274.
- Frank, Manfred/Zanetti, Véronique 2001, Dialektik der teleologischen Urteilkraft, in: *Schriften zur Ästhetik und Naturphilosophie*, Frankfurt/M., III 1286–1306.
- Ginsborg, Hannah 2006, Kant's Biological Teleology and its Philosophical Significance, in: Bird, Graham (ed.), *The Blackwell Companion to Kant*, Oxford, 455–469.
- McLaughlin, Peter 1989a, *Die Antinomie der Urteilkraft*, Bonn; transl. 1990, *Kant's Critique of Teleology in Biological Explanation. Antinomy and Teleology*, Lampeter, 1990.
- 1989b, What is an Antinomy of Judgment?, in: Funke, G./Seebohm T. M. (eds.), *Akten des sechsten Internationalen Kant-Kongresses*, Washington, II/2 357–367.
- Nuzzo, Angelica 2009, Kritik der Urteilkraft §§ 76–77: Reflective Judgment and the Limits of Transcendental Philosophy, in: Heidemann, Dietmar (ed.), *Kant Yearbook 1*, Berlin/New York, 143–172.
- Quarfood, Marcel 2004, The Antinomy of Teleological Judgment, in: *Transcendental Idealism and the Organism*, Stockholm, 160–208.
- Watkins, Eric 2008, Die Antinomie der teleologischen Urteilkraft und Kants Ablehnung alternativer Teleologien (§§ 69–73), in: Höffe, Otfried (ed.), *Immanuel Kant. Kritik der Urteilkraft*, Berlin, 241–258.
- 2009, The Antinomy of Teleological Judgment, in: Heidemann, Dietmar (ed.), *Kant Yearbook 1*, Berlin/New York, 197–221.
- Zanetti, Véronique 1993, Die Antinomie der teleologischen Urteilkraft, *Kant-Studien* 83, 341–355.
- Zuckert, Rachel 2007, *Kant on Beauty and Biology. An Interpretation of the "Critique of Judgment"*, Cambridge, 146–164.